What Works in Improving Local Government Performance

May 2, 2017
About the Alliance

Inspiring Innovation to Advance Communities
Go to Webinar

Clicking the Rectangle will Place You in Full Screen Mode

Clicking the Arrow on your Go To Webinar Toolbox opens and closes your viewer.

Please ask your questions using your Go To Webinar Toolbox

Tweet with Us: @transformgov #localgov
Introducing Today’s Presenters

- **Zach Markovits**, Director of City Programs, What Works Cities, Results for America
- **Andrew Bowen**, Data Program Coordinator, City of Charlotte, NC
- **Penny Macias**, Project Manager, Performance Office, City of Tulsa, OK
- **Brent Stockwell**, Assistant City Manager, City of Scottsdale, AZ
What Works Cities
Cities want to be doing this work, though don’t have the capacity to take it on effectively.

- **80%** of cities have engaged the public on a strategic goal
- **40%** have publicly communicated progress towards that goal
- **75%** have invested in a tool to release data to the public
- **20%** have a process to release these data regularly
- **75%** of cities are committed to using data and evidence to make decisions
- **33%** modify existing programs based on the results of program evaluation
What Works Cities is a Bloomberg Philanthropies initiative designed to accelerate cities’ use of data and evidence to improve people’s lives.
From 2015-2018, What Works Cities is partnering with 100 mid-sized American municipalities, with populations between 100,000 and 1,000,000.
What Works Cities

The What Works Cities Standard

**COMMIT**
What Works Cities leaders make powerful, public commitments to getting better results for their residents by using data and evidence.

**MEASURE**
What Works Cities leaders use data and tools at their disposal to measure progress and engage residents along the way.

**TAKE STOCK**
What Works Cities leaders consistently review and reflect to measure progress, learn, and make corrections and improvements.

**ACT**
What Works Cities leaders use data and evidence to inform major decisions and take action.
What Works Cities partners provide technical assistance to cities to help them achieve their goals.
What Works Cities

Building Capacity through targeted technical assistance

Open Data & Data Management

Performance & Analytics

Low-Cost Evaluation

Results-Driven Contracting
Cities have already seen the impact of this work

13 cities that have modified the delivery of existing programs based on the results of a newly created performance management process.

- **Mesa, AZ**, shifted funding to target the most blighted neighborhoods.
- **Lincoln, NE**, restructured urban development and home ownership programs based on new trends.
- **Jackson, MS**, used its performance management system to identify over $4mm in savings.

Many cities that have used evaluations to test small tweaks to improve the service of programs in the city:

- **New Orleans, LA**, used text messaging to get more low-income residents to a free exam.
- **Louisville, KY & Chattanooga, TN**, are finding ways to encourage residents to address code violations more quickly.
- **Denver, CO**, is shortening lines at the DMV by urging more people to use online services.
What Works Cities

77 Active Cities
PROVIDE A PATH TO SUCCESS
• Criteria outlines best practices using data and evidence to drive local government policies and processes and establish a path to get there.

RECOGNIZE HARD WORK
• Recognizes the efforts and progress of city staff and leadership by providing them with tools, resources, and benefits to improve continuously.

REWARD EXCELLENCE
• Publicly rewards cities achieving a standard of excellence.

ACCELERATE THE NATIONAL MOVEMENT
• Creates a way to continuously engage new cities and encourage cities to draw on the power of data to make smarter decisions and drive better results for their residents.
What Works Certification

WWC Certification is the first ever national standard for local government effectiveness, recognizing excellence and providing all cities a roadmap to a more outcomes focused government.

- Good
- Great
- Exemplary
Does your local government have a codified open data policy?

The City of New Orleans developed a formal, comprehensive open data policy to institutionalize the public release of important city data. Mayor Landrieu signed an executive order to sustain these practices.

Does your local government measure outcomes, impacts, and/or cost-effectiveness of key procurements?

The City of Seattle is now measuring how effectively homelessness providers are helping homelessness individuals find stable housing, and not just how many meals they are serving.

Does your local government convene a performance management program (i.e. Stat meetings)?

Kansas City developed a citywide performance management program as well as DepartmentStat in January 2016. The City worked with targeted departments and the City Manager to develop department goals and metrics to track its progress.

In the last 12 months, has your local government initiated low-cost or randomized evaluation of priority city programs or services?

The City of Louisville worked with the Behavioral Insights Team to identify and design evaluations to improve three specific city services, including code compliance.
WHAT are you waiting for?

Go now to whatworkscities.org now to apply.

Deadline is May 1
Oh, C.R.A.P.!

City of Charlotte
Research & Analytics Program

Andrew Bowen
Data Program Coordinator
Research & Analytics

Our Mission: Collaborative Problem-Solving with Data

- **Data** - as a strategic resource that is timely, secure, transparent
- **Discovery** - research, evaluate, solve problems (improve services) and make decisions (inform policy)
- **People** - build skills/capacity and culture
- **Engagement** – work with and within the community through storytelling and engagement

*City of Charlotte...fueled by data and curiosity*
WHAT COULD WE DO BETTER IF WE HAD THE RIGHT INFORMATION?

Start with curious and creative people. That’s you.

Add a lot of good data. Then analyze it.

Factor in...

- BUSINESS PROCESSES
- BEHAVIORAL INSIGHTS
- POLICIES

COLLABORATIVE PROBLEM SOLVING

OPERATIONAL EFFICIENCY

IMPROVED PERFORMANCE

ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY & DEVELOPMENT

COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT & TRUST
Celebrating Success!

*In the process and the outcomes*

- Dataset Census
- Data Academy
- Performance Dashboard
- Behavioral Insights Workshop
- Research & Analytics Projects
Projects
Heeding Lessons...

**Getting it right the second time**
- Commitment = Heft, breadth, and depth
- Hit it from both sides
- Value of a national (support) network
- This is fun work; remember to do it fun-ly
- Always check your acronyms!
Tulsa, Oklahoma

Here we are!!!
Tulsa, Oklahoma

Our Municipal Government

• Strong Mayor-Council form of government
• Current Mayor: GT Bynum, as of December 2016
• 9 City Councilors
• 20 Departments
• 100+ Authorities, Boards, and Commissions

Our City

• Population: 399,682
• Size: 186.8 mi²
• America’s Most Generous City
• Great arts & historical sites
• Home to some Fortune 500 & Best Companies to Work For
Tulsa, OK – Leading Is Rough but Rewarding

- Tulsa was the first city to work as a pilot city with the WWC team.

- 2 aspects of our work plan
  - Phase 1: Open Data;
  - Phase 2: Performance Management (STAT) Program

- We learned a LOT!
So what did we learn?

The Open Data concept brings different people to the table with potentially competing interests.

They BOTH are important viewpoints, and we have to find common ground – both want to benefit our citizens.
It’s good to have a vision.

It’s also wise to be prepared to change course if necessary.

What does your entire organization need?

How can you make baby steps to success?

If there are short term and long term wins work on them both at the same time. Move the needle.
Long term work

Policies & procedures

Identifying Resources

Building Buy-in
Short Term Wins – Empower the Organization to Use Data
Urban Data Pioneers

- 60+ Members passionate about data
  - City staff & Community Partners

- Small teams - Teaching each other
  - What data exists & where to find it
  - How to use different tools to visualize and analyze it

- Zero Cost (other than time)
Performance Management is not one size fits all

A performance management program can bring out different viewpoints
What Works for your Organization

• Evaluate your culture
• Be really clear about what you hope to accomplish with a performance management program
• Be really clear about what you are NOT trying to accomplish
• Ask for feedback from those you need to participate
• Be patient and offer help
• Have a vision AND Embrace ambiguity – it’s okay if we aren’t 100% sure where we go
• Be willing to change your approach (that’s what you’re asking others to do)

• Started with Public Safety Stat and tried to cover ALL the public safety initiatives. Too broad and way too slow.

• Revised to do Stat meetings more departmental based/focused

You can see our upcoming schedules here: https://www.cityoftulsa.org/government/performance-strategy-and-innovation/tulstat/

• Include support departments who’s work empowers the public facing teams to deliver quality services
Never Underestimate the Power of Leadership Commitment

Leadership Matters! Our Mayor & Chief of Performance, Strategy & Innovation listening to a presentation at one of our first TulStat meetings (published at tulsaworld.com)
We are a What Works City!
SCOTTSDALE, AZ
@scottsdaleazgov
“One of the dirty secrets of government is actually that we don’t know whether what we’re doing works a lot of the time.”

Rory Gallagher, Behavioral Insights Team
What is the Behavioral Insights approach?

1. Use what we already know about human behavior to make local government programs and services better.
This is what $120 looks like.

If you don’t submit your Health Risk Assessment by Aug. 15, **you’ll miss out on $120**.

That’s the incentive each employee receives for completing it. If you have a spouse or partner on the city’s health plan, you earn another $120 if they do it, too.
Still need a better reason? This is what a $100 Visa gift card looks like.

As an added incentive, 300 gift cards just like this one have been raffled-off to employees who completed their HRA. Wouldn’t you like to get one?

We’re giving 10 more $100 gift cards away. If you don’t complete your HRA, you won’t be eligible for the final drawing.

More than 700 employees have already completed their HRA. If you aren’t among them, it’s not too late.
2. Test these approaches using randomized control trials to find out what really works.
Annex 1: Yes and No buttons email

From: Greg Bestgen, City of Scottsdale
Subject: Scottsdale Cares!

Dear neighbor,

Scottsdale Cares is an easy way for you to give back to your community. 100% of donations go to local non-profits that help Scottsdale residents in need.

Local charities needed more than $400,000 in funding to support Scottsdale residents, but Scottsdale Cares was only able to fund one-fourth of the need. This year, thousands of your neighbors have stepped up. But there’s more work to be done.

Would you like to join your neighbors and donate to Scottsdale Cares?

NO, I do not want to donate $1/month to Scottsdale Cares.

YES, I want to donate $1/month to Scottsdale Cares!
Annex 2: Just yes button email

From: Greg Bestgen, City of Scottsdale
Subject: Scottsdale Cares!

Dear neighbor,

Scottsdale Cares is an easy way for you to give back to your community. 100% of donations go to local non-profits that help Scottsdale residents in need.

Local charities needed more than $400,000 in funding to support Scottsdale residents, but Scottsdale Cares was only able to fund one-fourth of the need. This year, thousands of your neighbors have stepped up. But there’s more work to be done.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Funded</th>
<th>Unable to fund</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$0</td>
<td>$100,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$200,000</td>
<td>$300,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$400,000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Would you like to join your neighbors and donate to Scottsdale Cares?

YES, I want to donate $1/month to Scottsdale Cares!
Proportion of people donating

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No email</th>
<th>Yes button</th>
<th>Yes and no button</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0.4%</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td>1.5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

N=15,771

** p≤0.01, * p≤0.05, + p≤0.1
Hi [NAME],

Are you up for a challenge?

I love being a police officer because no two days are the same. It’s challenging, but I feel like I’m my best self every day.

Scottsdale Police has changed its recruitment process, and we are looking for new officers to join our department. I hope you consider applying. **If you thrive in a challenging environment, you’re just the kind of person we’re looking for.**


Good luck!

*Marcos Garcia*
Police Officer, Scottsdale Police Department
Hi [NAME],

You belong with the Scottsdale police department.

I love being a police officer because from day one, I felt like I belonged to a team - no matter where you come from, you feel like you belong here.

Scottsdale Police has changed its recruitment process, and we are looking for new officers to join our department. I hope you consider applying. If you work well with a team, you’re just the kind of person we’re looking for.


Good luck!

Marcos Garcia
Police Officer, City of Scottsdale Police Department
Percentage submitting an application

- **Control**: 0.9%
- **Belonging**: 2.4%
- **Challenge**: 2.5%

N=17,055

*** p≤0.001, ** p≤0.01, * p≤0.05, + p≤0.1
You need a tangible and impactful goal, with a clear, short-term outcome
You need access to relevant data and a substantial sample size.
It’s not just about communicating better (although that does help)
It’s not a cure all, you’re likely to find processes need improvement
It helps to have a BI Ninja or two… someone passionate about using behavioral insights & testing what works
Q&A

- **Zach Markovits**, Director of City Programs, What Works Cities, Results for America

- **Andrew Bowen**, Data Program Coordinator, City of Charlotte, NC

- **Penny Macias**, Project Manager, Performance Office, City of Tulsa, OK

- **Brent Stockwell**, Assistant City Manager, City of Scottsdale, AZ
Webinar Resources
To Receive Copies, Contact rspillers@transformgov.org
Thank you for joining!

What Works in Improving Local Government Performance